Partecipation, Districts and Metropolitan city
Experiences in Milan

Antonella Bruzzese
Vice President and Councilor in Urban Planning at Municipio 3, Comune di Milano
Associate Professor at Politecnico di Milano, DASS Department of Architecture and Urban Studies

Barcelona, 23.10.18
METROPOLI CERCANA. DESCENTRALIZACIÓN, GOBERNANZA Y PARTECIPACIÓN EN PENDISTRITOS DE BARCELONA
Institut d'Estudis Regionals i Metropolitans de Barcelona


Comparison 1999, 2004
Source: Arpa Lombardia

Urban development outside the city

2. Metropolitan city and Districts (Municipi)
Reforms on decentralization still to be completed.

3. Partecipation, experiences
Citizens protagonism, involvement and role of the Districts / An urban theme, conflicts, the forms of consultation

Inhabitants, a different trend

Una nuova fase di sviluppo
La popolazione di Milano tocca a crescere e continua a crescere a partire dal 2010 e in relativo più netta dal 2015. Censimenti in parte a conferma in data più giovani, con un aumento dei residenti tra i 18 e 34 anni (+2.7%). La tendenza mostrata il consolidamento del salto della città nell'agglomerato di Milano che vivono in Milano un’opportunità per vivere e lavorare spesso a lavoro (university).

Temporary population
• 180,000 students in the city’s university:
  - only 35,000 from Milan
• 300,000 patients in the Milan’s hospitals
• coming from all the Country
• 4.5 million visitors per year in the Milano Fair (Furniture, Fashion, Computers, etc)

Towards Milano 2030: Piano di Governo del Territorio - PGT

Source: Comune di Milano - PGT Milano 2030

INHABITANTS 2001-2013: a different trend

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anno</th>
<th>Popolazione residenti</th>
<th>Variazione % Media Annua (2007/2013)</th>
<th>Variazione % Media Annua (2010/2013)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>1.330.000</td>
<td>+0,31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>1.316.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>1.302.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>1.288.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>1.274.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>1.260.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>1.246.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>1.232.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>1.218.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>1.330.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1.316.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>1.302.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1.288.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Comune di Milano – ISTAT al 31 dicembre di ogni anno


Il grafico dell’andamento della popolazione residente nel Comune di Milano considera i dati raccolti per un periodo che parte dal 2001 al 21 dicembre 2013.

Dalla rappresentazione dei dati si nota una lieve crescita relativamente della popolazione milanese, se si tiene in considerazione la variazione percentuale media annua per il periodo 2007 - 2013. I dati relativi al periodo 2010 - 2013 invece mostrano una crescita nulla, confermando la tendenza ormai nota nelle grandi città occidentali europee e statunitensi. I dati così rappresentati mostrano però soltanto un lato della medaglia. Sempre secondo i dati istat, a popolazione invariata, il numero delle famiglie ha conosciuto un’espansione continua. Ciò avviene come conseguenza della riconfigurazione della struttura famigliare e del numero minore di componenti che caratterizza ormai le società occidentali da anni.
Urban transformations in the city centre: new private developments
Garibaldi Repubblica - Porta Nuova / City Life - Tre torri

Urban transformations in the city centre: new cultural and urban actors
Fondazione Prada (OMA) / Fondazione Feltrinelli (Herzog & De Meuron)

Urban transformations in the city centre: new public spaces
Darsena / Piazza Gae Aulenti / Parco Biblioteca degli alberi
Urban transformations in the city centre: big projects/vision on going

Post Expo – MIND (Milan Innovation District) - Città Studi / Railway yards / opening of some segments of the old canals (Navigli)

Demographic growth (elderly and youngest)
Still a city of services
After a period of market stagnation, urban economy re-started in the city centre - visible in the city skyline and in its public spaces.
Perception of Milan deeply changed in recent years.
Polarization / gentrification

2. Metropolitan city and Districts (Municipi)
Reforms on decentralization still to be completed
**Metropolitan cities** have been defined in Italy for the first time by Law 142/1990 Regulation of local autonomies.

- **With the reform of Title V of the Italian Constitution** (Law n. 3 /2001) is given constitutional legitimation to them.
- From 01/01/2015, the **Metropolitan City of Milan** replaces the pre-existing Province of Milan.

**Government bodies**:
- Council: executive branch and metropolitan mayor
- Functions:
  - Adopt and update the metropolitan strategic plan;
  - Take care of spatial planning in terms of infrastructures, service networks and communications;
  - Develop coordinated management of public services;
  - Develop systems and structures for mobility;
  - Develop computerization and digitalization systems;
  - Institutional relations, including those with other European cities and metropolitan areas.

**Metropolitan city of Milan**

- **134 municipalities**
- **1.576 kmq** Surface
- **3.218.201** inhabitants
- **2.042 ab/kmq** density

**Some limits**

**Perimeters**
- The municipalities along the first historical Milanese industrial conurbation line, Milan-Monza, are excluded from the Milan metropolitan area, as well as a large part of the Sempione industrial district and the airport intercontinental of Milan Malpensa.
- Statistically, the Metropolitan Area of Milan is larger and has more than 6,000,000 inhabitants.

**Representativeness / delegation**
- Second-level elections: the metropolitan council is a second-level elective organ, composed of the metropolitan mayor and 24 councillors. Holders of the active and passive electorate are mayors and councillors in charge of the Municipalities included in the territory of the Metropolitan City of Milan.

**Role and functions**
- Lack of incisiveness of the role of coordination of the Province on its territory.
The administrative structure: City of Milano and its 9 districts («zones», now «municipi»)

With the same Law 56/2014 which established the Metropolitan City, also the Districts - «Municipi» (the same perimeters of the Zones) have been established.

Regulations of Districts, approved with Milan City Council Resolution n. 17 of April 14, 2016
• Direct election of the President of the District
• Reduction in the number of councillors (31)
• Executive branch (3 assessors)
• Greater administrative autonomy

They are also established:
• Permanent Conference of the Presidents of the Districts, consultative body of the Mayor, the Council and the City Council
• Observatory on Municipalities whose purpose is to oversee the process of implementation of administrative decentralization

The areas of intervention of the Municipality, indicated in the Municipal Statute, are:
• educational, cultural and sport services;
• management and maintenance of the assigned municipal buildings (auditorium, gym, etc.);
• private construction (management of small permissions);
• (partial) management of public green areas and urban furniture
• Dialogue with local police for urban security and neighborhood traffic;
• commercial and craft activities

> Management of funds and contributions (for cultural and social activities of associations, provision of funds for the right to study)

> Attribution of patronage / sponsorship (of worthy initiatives)

> Formulation of Advice (consultative activity)

> Promotion of information and citizen participation in relation to the activity of the Municipality itself.

Municipi a Milano

Limits

• Scarcity of resources (economic and human)
• Scarcity of Autonomy (derivative financial statement / derivative financial statement)
• Weak Role (little recognition, poor clarity of roles)
Art. 2 - I Municipi.
1. I Municipi, nell'ambito dell'unità del Comune di Milano, rappresentano le rispettive comunità, ne curano gli interessi e ne promuovono lo sviluppo, in quanto organismi di partecipazione, consultazione e gestione dei servizi di prossimità presenti sul territorio.

Art. 2 - Municipalities.
1. The Districts, within the unity of the Municipality of Milan, represent their communities, take care of their interests and promote their development, as bodies for participation, consultation and management of local services in the area.

- how civic participation is structured in the district (means, organs and tools)
- the relation between public participation and governance in the district of Milan, how and by which mechanisms participation has an impact on politics and policies at both the district level and the city.

«Ordinary»
- Citizens can freely come and talk in the half an hour before the Municipal council
- Citizens can be involved in the different Local Commissions
- Citizens can send mail, call, etc. Easier to get in touch with the Councillors
- Public meetings
- Work with the formal and informal associations

«extraordinary»
- Participatory budget
- Consultation about the transformation of abandoned railway yards
3. Participation, two experiences

Citizens protagonism, involvement, role of the Districts / An urban theme, conflicts, the forms of consultation

The Participatory Budget is a tool of participatory administration now widespread throughout the world that, on the basis of a budget allocated by a public body (usually a municipality) directly allows citizens to propose, plan and vote for interventions for their territory, which they will then be realized by the Municipality itself.


The 2017-18 edition is funded by the CAPS research and innovation program - “Horizon 2020” and implemented in collaboration with the European research project EMPATIA.

Projects between 100 and 500,000 Euro

WHO?

HOW MUCH?

HOW?

BONUS

A different role for Districts

HOW?

2 steps
First: proposals submitted have been supported by people voting > shortlist
Second step: co-design with PA, new turn of vote + bonus

Source: Comune di Milano
www.bilanciopartecipativo.comune.milano.it
• Improving Walkability
  Interventi che migliorino le condizioni per camminare in città al fine di ottenere ambienti più accoglienti e accessibili per i pedoni e in particolare per bambini e per anziani e soggetti con difficoltà motorie e altre disabilità (itinerari per disabili, percorsi sicuri di accesso alle scuole, ma anche itinerari alla scoperta di luoghi di valore storico ambientale, zone 30, pedonalizzazione parziali o temporanee etc.) poiché si ritiene che il livello di “camminabilità” di un quartiere sia direttamente proporzionale alla qualità e vivibilità urbana;

• Improving sport activities
  Interventi per promuovere e migliorare le possibilità di praticare sport e giocare all’aria aperta, una vera e propria “palestra a cielo aperto” negli spazi e nei giardini pubblici, per tutte le fasce di età, con particolare attenzione agli adolescenti (da percorsi vita, strutture per calisthenics o simili, parkour etc.), a persone affette da disabilità (giochi per bimbi disabili) e ai più piccoli (giochi d’acqua, etc.), con la motivazione che favorire una vita attiva attraverso la diffusione dello sport sia importante per i cittadini e per la salute pubblica;

• Improving stay and stay safe
  Progetti per migliorare la fruizione degli spazi pubblici (sia i luoghi di sosta come piazze e giardini, sia i luoghi dell’attesa come le fermate dei mezzi pubblici, sia incroci stradali etc.) con interventi volti a migliorare la percezione di sicurezza, la loro illuminazione e visibilità, con la motivazione che stare, sostare e muoversi agevolmente e in sicurezza è la condizione di base per un quartiere vivibile.

---

**Pros & cons**

+ An [tool for direct citizen's involvement](#) in designing

+- Local problems and solutions

+ A different role - of mediation and direction - for the Districts

- Strong selection of participants - demanding engagement
Railway yards

Seven railway yards are about to be totally or partially dismissed:
Farini-Lugano, Greco-Breda, Lambrate, Rogoredo, Porta Romana, Porta Genova, San Cristoforo.

They totally cover an area of 1,300,000 mq (0.7% entire territory of Milan).

Different sizes (from 630,000 mq Farini to 21,000 mq Rogoredo).

Diverse characteristics (functions/context/connections and green/nature of the borders).

Source: Dastu - Politecnico di Milano – «Trasformazione degli scali ferroviari» – maggio 2014
Source: Comune di Milano «Presentazione AdP 2017» luglio 2017
2005: The negotiation process between the State Railways, the City of Milan and the Lombardy Region starts with a First Accord di Programma (program agreement) to govern the capital gains (plusvalenze) the Railways would get from the transformations (new uses) of the areas.

2007: The agreement (AdP) – signed in a previous version first in July 2005 by the mayor of Milan Gabriele Albertini and then by Mayor Letizia Moratti - provides that the capital gains of the transformations are reinvested in the Milan node with interventions on public rail transport.

2010: The Urban Plan of Milano PGT, was approved by the Consiglio comunale (adozione 14.7.2010)

Economic crisis: Compared to 2004 the real estate market in the mayor cities in Italy has drastically reduced (-48%)

2011: June - new Mayor Giuliano Pisapia and review of the PGT (with a strong reduction of the building rights ratio and the volumes previously indicated for the railway yards are frozen and reduced)

2012: The PGT reviewed was approved in October 2012. It contains general addresses for the transformations of the railway yards, nothing about volumes.

2014: A contract with the Politecnico di Milano for an “active listening” has been signed

2014: Contract between the City of Milan and the Politecnico di Milano (Department of Architecture and Urban Studies): scientific support aimed at defining addresses for the transformation of the railway yards based on the recognition of the positions of local communities

AIMS
- analyze the expectations of local actors (Consigli di Zona, associations and organizations representing citizens, inhabitants, users);
- verify and map the local projects;
- facilitate the dialogue between the municipal administration and local actors.

HOW?
- Reconstruction of the state of art: reading of the actual condition of the areas, map of actors
- meetings with Zones + Internal workshop/focus groups with actors and associations about Services, Open spaces, Borders and connections
- Gathering a general territorial interpretation
A long story

2016
New mayor Sala, process re-start.

Wider public debate.
Many different groups of stakeholders against the operation.

Different approach.
Not only negotiation with the stakeholders but several occasions of discussion.

Document of addresses (City council).

2017
Debate in the City Council Commissions and in the Districts aimed at collecting suggestions for the final document (Delibera and AdP).

What the District did

Public meeting to inform
Un primo incontro pubblico (17.02.17) alla presenza dell’Assessore all’Urbanistica per informare la cittadinanza sul processo in corso, ascoltare i cittadini sulla realtà locale dello scalo.

Sharing documents to go in depth
Pubblicazione on line sul sito del Municipio dei documenti informativi;

Survey to get comments
Richiesta di compilazione di una scheda di consultazione, pubblicata sul sito del Municipio per raccogliere indicazioni inerenti le criticità generali dell’area e quelle relative a barriere e/o connessioni, bisogni locali, verde, funzioni, usi temporanei;

Source: Comune di Milano «Presentazione AdP 2017» luglio 2017
What the Discrict did

Collective site visit
Sopraluogo aperto ai cittadini del 04.03.17 per conoscere “da dentro” lo scalo Lambrate.

Second public meeting – discussion on survey results
Un secondo incontro pubblico, 17.03.17 lettura di sintesi delle schede di consultazione pervenute e discussione con i cittadini presenti;

Third public meeting on design explorations
Un terzo incontro pubblico, 05.04.17 di presentazione delle esplorazioni progettuali relative allo scalo di Lambrate dello Studio Zucchi e Studio Mecanoo nell’ambito dell’incarico Scali Vision di FS.

What the Distric got

Concerning contents: reduction of a 30% of built volume
Concerning method: sense of construction together

However

Limited ability to di orient the process
Volunteer dimension (being competence)
Times too short

4. Final remarks. Limits, potentialities, work directions
Who participates?
Representativeness / who are the people involved and how to enlarge the participation.

On what is useful and right organize participation?
The dilemma of reconciling sometimes divergent paths; do not create frustration

How to make effective participation?
Right to express positions vs. fully comprehend the complexity of the implications

When and with what resources?
The costs and times of participation

Citizens / Districts / City Level (Metropolitan city).
Relations to be improved